



Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND MIGRANT INTEGRATION  
IN LINE WITH OSCE COMMITMENTS AND  
INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS: A REVIEW OF GOOD  
PRACTICES**

**Expert Roundtable Meeting  
Warsaw, Poland  
26 October 2017**

**OSCE/ODIHR Meeting Report**



**Warsaw  
October 2017**

*This report should not be interpreted as comprising official OSCE recommendations based on a consensus decision, an opinion of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights or of any particular OSCE participating State. The content of this report reflects opinions expressed by participants which took place in Warsaw on 26 October 2017.*

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>MEETING SUMMARY.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>ANNEX 1: AGENDA .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>ANNEX 2: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>ANNEX 3: SELECTED OSCE COMMITMENTS IN THE AREA OF MIGRANT INTEGRATION .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>ABOUT THE OSCE/ODIHR .....</b>	<b>20</b>

# **LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND MIGRANT INTEGRATION IN LINE WITH OSCE COMMITMENTS AND INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS: A REVIEW OF GOOD PRACTICES**

**Regional Expert Roundtable  
Warsaw, Poland  
26 October 2017**

## **MEETING SUMMARY**

Organized with the aim of reviewing good practices and developing recommendations on migrant integration at the local level, the roundtable meeting brought together 43 participants (29 women and 14 men), including officials responsible for migrant integration issues from local and national authorities, relevant ministries and public agencies, as well as representatives of civil society organizations and academia from Armenia, Austria, the Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Georgia, Germany, Ireland, Italy, Kazakhstan, Latvia, Moldova, Poland, the Russian Federation, Serbia, Slovenia, Sweden, Switzerland, Ukraine and the United Kingdom, as well as representatives of the Council of Europe, the International Organization for Migration (IOM) and the independent think-tank Migration Policy Group. (Annex II provides a full list of participants.)

Migrant integration is a complex cross-cutting policy area of increasing relevance in the context of the current migration crisis. Its development and implementation involves a wide range of stakeholders. Cities and local authorities have a critical role to play in dealing with migrant integration challenges. While the scope of local and regional authorities' powers across OSCE area varies, policies related to migrant integration commitments are usually implemented, if not defined, by local level authorities and institutions. However, no international legally binding standards or general non-binding guidance exists for municipalities to respond to these challenges.

The roundtable was structured with an introductory session, followed by three working sessions (please see Annex I for the agenda) covering different aspects of the issue, and finally a concluding session.

The meeting began with opening remarks from Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director of ODIHR, who welcomed participants, noting the range of countries attending and underlining the importance of advancing dialogue and sharing good practices to help both local and national authorities address emerging problems while respecting OSCE commitments and international standards. Ms. Gardapkhadze also highlighted ODIHR's efforts to promote closer co-operation and synergy with the work of other relevant international organizations in the area of migration, and welcomed Mr. Tomáš Boček, the Council of Europe Secretary General's Special Representative on Migration and Refugees, who delivered the keynote presentation. Mr. Boček underlined the importance of mayors as opinion leaders, reflecting on the scope for municipalities to apply practical and innovative solutions, and on the need for effective co-operation between central government and municipalities to ensure effective reception and integration of refugees and migrants.

The Introductory Session reviewed good practices across the OSCE in local and central government co-ordination on migrant integration. The Session Chair, Mr. Juris Gromovs, ODIHR's Migration/Freedom of Movement Advisor, reiterated the crucial importance of dialogue and co-operation between local and central authorities on the development and implementation of migrant integration policies. Mr. Alexander Wolffhardt of the Migration Policy Group presented a paper commissioned by ODIHR "Local and central government co-ordination on the process of migrant integration: good practices across the OSCE region". He discussed various good practices from across the OSCE region and modalities for co-operation between local and central authorities, funding distribution structures, consultation mechanisms, as well as collaboration with local civil society and other non-public actors. His presentation was followed by observations on central-local co-ordination from Estonia, Serbia and Moldova, the three participating States addressing these processes in different ways. Representing the Bureau for Migration and Asylum of the Republic of Moldova, Ms. Tatiana Ciumaş presented inter-institutional co-operation between relevant ministries involved in migrant integration in Moldova, including the mechanism of referring migrants to relevant public authorities, and consultation mechanisms with civil society and the migrant population. Mr. Kaarel-Mati Halla of Tallinn City Government discussed co-operation between the City of Tallinn and central government (the Ministry of Interior and Ministry of Social Affairs), including the establishment of a high-level city government co-ordination committee on refugee admission and service provision in order to facilitate co-operation between departments and define principles for refugee settlement in the city. Representing the Commissariat for Refugees and Migration of the Republic of Serbia, Ms. Jelena Marjanović outlined the Serbian model of co-operation between national and local levels which requires that local authorities establish Migration Management Councils and adopt strategies, Local Action Plans, for the integration of refugees and displaced persons.

Working Session I addressed ways of ensuring equality and gender-sensitive approaches in access to services at the local level in the OSCE region, including common challenges and national good practices. The Session Chair, Ms. Anna Rostocka, the Director of IOM Warsaw, pointed out that migration processes are increasingly feminized and stressed the need for a gender-sensitive approach to migrant integration and provision of services. Prof. Charles Husband of Bradford University provided a valuable reminder that ensuring genuine equality in access to services may require specially tailored measures for particular groups, including girls and women. He also emphasized the need for carrying out equality impact assessments in relation to any proposed new policy, reaffirming the importance of open dialogue with multiple and diverse partners. Mr. Giuseppe Nicolini, from the International Protection Service in Bologna, Italy, discussed various aspects of the implementation of the protection system for asylum seekers and refugees (SPRAR), including assistance offered to migrants in procedures to access social, health and educational services, orientation in relation to local services, and support from linguistic mediators. Ms. Shakhnoza Khassanova, representing the Legal Centre for Women's Initiatives "Sana Sezim" from Shymkent, Kazakhstan, discussed labour migrants' vulnerable position and the problems they face, including lack of guaranteed access to public services. Ms. Anna Fedas of the European Solidarity Centre presented the migrant integration model of the city of Gdańsk, developed through an inclusive participatory process involving over eighty local institutions and stakeholders. She emphasized the need for training and education of local service providers' staff, as well as the need to listen to the migrants themselves, and highlighted that the city of Gdańsk was also the first Polish city to establish a migrant consultative body, the Gdansk Council of Immigrants.

Working Session II saw discussion of good practices in the OSCE region related to welcome, civic orientation and integration measures at the local level. Representing the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe, Ms. Yoomi Renström, Mayor of Ovanåker in Sweden, emphasized the role of political leaders in shaping public attitudes towards migration and the need to raise their awareness about migration and migrant integration as part of longer-term strategic thinking. Ms. Bitten Holmer Flansmose of Skanderborg Municipality, Denmark, highlighted the need to promote migrants' civic engagement, e.g. inviting residents of migrant background to act as advisers to municipal authorities on integration-related issues. Presenting the Skanderborg model, she also underlined the role of volunteers in assisting the process of migrant integration. Ms. Magda Faltová, Director of the Association for Integration and Migration from Prague, the Czech Republic, also emphasized the need for regular interaction and close co-operation between local authorities and local civil society working on migration issues, including migrant associations. She shared the positive experience of co-operation between the Municipality of Prague and a local NGO, which produced an online and paper map with all relevant local institutions and services available for migrants. Another civil society representative, Ms. Alicja Kaczmarek, Director of the Polish Expatriates Association based in Birmingham, the United Kingdom, confirmed the role of non-governmental organizations in assisting migrant adaptation and integration and presented the work of the Erdington Welcome Centre, which provides advice, information and support on housing, employment, health and family matters to Eastern European migrants, also serving as a community hub for local cultural life, a platform for intercultural dialogue, and a networking and meeting space for local NGOs. Representing the Ministry of Interior of the Russian Federation, Ms. Valentina Kazakova discussed the process of implementation of the policy on social and cultural adaptation and integration of migrants in the Russian Federation. Ms. Myroslava Keryk of the Warsaw-based "Our Choice" Foundation working with Ukrainian migrants in Poland also reiterated the need to acknowledge the role migrant civil society organizations play in assisting migrant integration and stressed the importance of local authorities' close co-operation with civil society in promoting positive relations between migrants and receiving communities.

Working Session III focused on the integration of migrant children and youth at the local level. Prof. Nihad Bunar of Stockholm University emphasized that education is an essential element of comprehensive social or integration policies supporting the inclusion of entire families in local communities, helping to connect them to opportunity structures relevant to employment, further education and civic engagement. He also stressed the need to make every effort to avoid school segregation, including minimizing the time migrant children spend in separate classes or separate educational facilities. Ms. Hedwig Bvumburah, of the Cross Culture International Foundation (CCIF) from Paola, Malta, highlighted the need to promote inclusive municipalities and neighbourhoods in which young migrants can actively participate in policy-making and contribute to the development of their communities. Mr. Omar Al-Rawi, member of Vienna City Council, Austria, discussed the City of Vienna "Jugendcollege" (Youth College) programme aimed at young migrants beyond the age of compulsory school attendance for whom public education is not available. This programme aims to equip young migrants with the skills necessary for continuing their education, vocational training or finding employment. Ms. Helga Maria Nagel of the "Citoyen" Foundation from Frankfurt-am-Main, Germany, reiterated the need to work with whole families to achieve successful migrant integration and presented some good practices in this field from Frankfurt. She discussed the "Mummy learnt Deutsch" programme aimed at adult migrant parents that supplements the municipality-provided German language courses and the government integration courses, as well as the "HIPPY" Home Instruction Programme for

Parents of Preschool Youngsters is aimed at pre-school children and their parents. Ms. Maria Charmast of the “Zavarka” club for Russian-speaking adults and children in Warsaw, who chaired this session, also drew attention to the importance of migrant children’s first language development and stressed the role of extracurricular educational programmes in their native language.

The Closing Session reviewed the main challenges and conclusions for the way forward. Ms. Christine Hirst from ODIHR provided a summary of the key conclusions and recommendations<sup>1</sup> identified by the conference speakers and participants during the meeting.

## CONCLUDING RECOMMENDATIONS

### 1. **Establish clear legal frameworks which provide for consistent and predictable application, and the protection and promotion of migrants’ rights.**

While local government plays an essential role, and in many cases has great latitude in the policies and approaches it takes to migrant integration, certain areas and issues vital for migrant integration remain a central-level competency, such as for example the right to work or access to education. Uncertainty in such areas presents obstacles to practical work with migrants: legislation that provides a framework for integration is essential.

### 2. **Recognize the creative, substantive and influential role that local authorities can play in migrant integration.**

In addition to working as the main implementers of migrant integration actions at the local level, local government plays a very significant role in developing local-level policies to respond to the needs which they experience. Interestingly, there are many instances where local authorities perceive the value and importance of migrant integration before this is recognized at central level, with a number of cases of pioneering work undertaken by cities in several OSCE participating States that have succeeded in influencing central-level policies on migrant integration and encouraging positive action.

### 3. **Acknowledge the need for planning and strategy at the local level for migrant integration.**

The wide range of stakeholders, officials and bodies responsible for different aspects of migrant integration requires comprehensive and inclusive approaches to planning and development of local-level strategies and action plans for migrant integration. Strong good practices exist, and there is clear evidence that where participatory and inclusive processes are followed, these processes themselves have the potential to generate resources and capacities for migrant integration, as well as the plans they were initiated to produce.

### 4. **Establish effective co-ordination mechanisms.**

---

<sup>1</sup> These good practices and recommendations have no official status and are not based on consensus of OSCE participating States. Their inclusion in this report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the OSCE/ODIHR.

Just as the range and complexity of stakeholders and responsible agencies demands comprehensive planning processes, it also requires effective co-ordination mechanisms – both among actors at the local level, as well as between local and central level. Sadly, few good models of governance exist in relation to central-local co-ordination on migrant integration, and this is an area that requires more attention as poor co-ordination is regularly noted as an obstacle to more effective and efficient integration action. Co-ordination should include basic processes such as data and information-sharing, go beyond this to involving the local level in the design, implementation and monitoring of national strategies, and also provide for the benefits of horizontal networks among authorities and local agencies to encourage learning from peer organizations.

**5. Ensure partnership between civil society and local authorities on migrant integration.**

The activities, skills and knowledge involved in migrant integration make it an area where local government can particularly benefit from collaboration with civil society. Without exception, models and examples of good practices in migrant integration all involve such collaboration. There is a wide variety of ways in which civil society works with local government in this field – ranging from very formal partnerships in specially established entities, to NGOs delivering certain services for local authorities, to voluntary partners in consultative processes or support schemes. Civil society actors often have the knowledge and skills which local authorities have not yet been able to develop within their staff, and are frequently the initiators of processes. Equally, good practice examples also see local government action to support the development of civil society partners when none or few exist, including through skills development and funding, leading to the creation of these essential partnerships.

**6. Raise awareness about the particular value of education as a process which has the potential to benefit multiple stakeholders in the migrant integration process.**

It has been long-established that participation in education and attendance at schools and colleges is an essential route for young migrants' integration, and situations where this is not possible, or where migrant children are taught in segregated classes, should be promptly addressed. Equally, good practices see education institutions also providing many opportunities for wider migrant families and groups to engage with host communities and integrate. Beyond this however, there is a need to recognize that the process of education also requires education and new skills for those involved in teaching and working with migrants – looking ahead, policy-makers are encouraged to include intercultural communication as a standard element of teacher, social worker and public officials' qualifications and training.

**7. Recognize the advantages and positive results which individual, flexible approaches to support can bring.**

In education, and also in support for social integration, job-seeking, and other integration areas, lessons learned and shared from across the OSCE region underline that tailored programmes where the individual strengths, weaknesses, skills,

languages, abilities and experiences of migrant men, women, boys and girls are assessed and taken into account when planning their support are far more successful.

**8. Develop capacities for a range of stakeholders involved in the process in order to ensure effective migrant integration.**

The need for local authorities to develop the capacities of their staff, both in terms of knowledge (of entitlements, procedures, etc.) and skills (intercultural communication, languages, etc.), is clear. Local and central government must recognize that public officials at a range of levels will need support if they are to be successful actors in integration processes, and ensure that support to develop these capacities is available and resourced. The value of networks among professions, municipalities, institutions and organizations, whether schools, social welfare offices or NGOs, was underlined.

**9. Promote discussions and help re-frame many of the inherently negative assumptions about migration.**

Given the demographic shifts and economic push-pull forces at play across different countries in the OSCE region, there is a need to recognize and discuss the benefits which migration can bring. Ranging from regeneration of de-populated rural areas to essential labour force inputs for countries with ageing populations, or contributors to thriving and creative urban centres, migration has huge positive potential. Yet discussion of migration is often stuck in negative discourse and fixed ‘us/them’ positioning. Good practice examples of successful integration measures often include elements of reforming these perspectives – introducing new terminology (e.g. “new inhabitants”), encouraging dialogue (e.g. “sharing good stories”), and reframing how people see their community and its future to help shift to understandings of a shared future in which all communities need to invest.

**10. Ensure ethical and value-based approaches and leadership.**

In many of the good practices discussed, people’s values are mentioned – ranging from a city’s identity being strongly linked to certain values of inclusion and diversity, to entire support schemes run on the principle of volunteerism. Multiple examples of successful migrant integration initiatives contain evidence or stages where the values of those involved – communities, volunteers, officials – helped to shape the action they took, and many migrant integration strategies explicitly define the values or vision which they are guided by in their work. Government and political leaders have a particularly important role to play in defining, promoting and protecting these values, and a vital responsibility to counter xenophobia and prejudice: practitioners emphasized the key role of mayors in local government work on migrant integration, and their potential for both positive and negative influence on integration processes.



**ANNEX 1: AGENDA**

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND MIGRANT INTEGRATION IN LINE WITH OSCE COMMITMENTS AND INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS: A REVIEW OF GOOD PRACTICES**

**ROUNDTABLE**

**26 October 2017**

**Helsinki Room, OSCE ODIHR Offices  
10 Miodowa, Warsaw, Poland**

The expert round table will review the diverse experience of OSCE participating States related to the role of local authorities in migrant integration, identify challenges and good practices, and develop recommendations. The discussion and recommendations are intended to support and inform practitioners in participating States who will benefit from exchange of experiences from across the region, and ODIHR in its development of future resources to assist participating States in meeting OSCE commitments on migrant integration. The discussion will be relevant for participating States where migrant integration is a more recent challenge, as well as States with well-developed integration systems which currently face challenges of adaptation and absorption due to an increase in migration. Speakers and participants will review challenges and opportunities in integrating men and women migrants at local and regional levels, focussing on co-ordination between local and central government, local authorities' role in implementing welcome, civic orientation and integration measures, ensuring equal access to public services, and fostering integration of children and youth, in line with relevant OSCE commitments and international standards. The roundtable is intended to contribute to increasing and sharing knowledge on these issues across the region, and will generate recommendations for future use and incorporation into forthcoming ODIHR publications and tools on migrant integration.

**26 October 2017**

<b>26 October 2017</b>	
<b>Registration of participants. Welcome coffee.</b>	<b>08:45-09:00</b>
<b>Opening Remarks:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR)</li> </ul>	<b>09:00-09:40</b>
<b>Key note presentation:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr. Tomáš Boček, Special Representative of the Secretary General on Migration and Refugees, Council of Europe</li> </ul>	

<p><b>Introductory Session: Local and central government co-ordination on migrant integration and good practices across the OSCE region</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr. Alexander Wolffhardt, Migration Policy Group: “Local and central government co-ordination on the process of migrant integration: good practices across the OSCE region” paper presentation</li> <li>- Ms. Tatiana Ciumaş, Head of Integration and Accommodation Unit, Bureau for Migration and Asylum, Bureau for Migration and Asylum, Ministry of Interior, the Republic of Moldova</li> <li>- Mr. Kaarel-Mati Halla, Coordination Director, Tallinn City Government the city of Tallinn, Estonia</li> <li>- Ms. Jelena Marjanović, expert for training on the development and implementation of EU projects, Commissariat for Refugees and Migration, Serbia</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair:</b> Mr. Juris Gromovs, Migration and Freedom of Movement Adviser, Democratization Department, ODIHR</p> <p><i>The Introductory Session will provide a brief overview of local and central government co-ordination on migrant integration and good practices across the OSCE region, setting the stage subsequent discussions in the following Working Sessions. While central government tends to define policies for migrant integration, local authorities are key actors for implementation. Processes for policy development and resourcing can be crucial to their successful implementation. An ODIHR-commissioned paper on this issue will be presented, followed by observations on central-local co-ordination from Estonia, Serbia and Moldova, three participating States addressing these processes in different ways.</i></p>	<p><b>09:40-11:15</b></p> <p><b>95mins</b></p>
<p><b>Coffee Break</b></p>	
<p><b>Working Session I: Lessons learnt and opportunities in ensuring equality and gender-sensitive approaches in access to services at the local level in the OSCE region</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Prof. Charles Husband, University of Bradford, United Kingdom/The Sami University of Applied Sciences, Guovdageaidnu, Norway</li> <li>- Mr. Giuseppe Nicolini, Project coordinator, International Protection Service, Bologna, Italy</li> <li>- Ms. Shakhnoza Khassanova, Vice-president of Legal Center for Women's Initiatives "Sana Sezim", Shymkent, Kazakhstan</li> <li>- Ms. Anna Fedas, Project coordinator, European Solidarity Centre, the City of Gdańsk, Poland</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair:</b> Ms. Anna Rostocka, Director of IOM Warsaw</p> <p><i>Working Session I will provide a platform for participants to discuss issues related to ensuring equal access to services at the local level. The speakers will discuss the role of local authorities in relevant national legislation implementation, good practices aimed at granting immigrants equal access to services at the local level, differences in how policies benefit men and women, ways in which policies affect men and women differently, as well as modalities for co-operation and co-ordination of local authorities with the range of relevant public institutions involved, and with civil society organizations.</i></p>	<p><b>11:15-11:30</b></p> <p><b>11:30-13:00</b></p> <p><b>90mins</b></p>
<p><b>Lunch</b></p>	

<p><b>Working Session II: Welcome, civic orientation and integration measures at the local level: good practices in the OSCE region</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms. Yoomi Renström, Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe, Rapporteur on migration and refugee issues</li> <li>- Ms. Bitten Holmer Flansmose, Development and Integration Consultant, Municipality of Skanderborg, Denmark</li> <li>- Ms. Magda Faltová, Director of Association for Integration and Migration, Prague, Czechia</li> <li>- Ms. Alicja Kaczmarek, Director of the Polish Expats Association, Birmingham, United Kingdom</li> <li>- Ms. Valentina Kazakova, Deputy Head of General Administration for Migration Issues, Ministry of Interior, Russian Federation</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair:</b> Ms. Myroslava Keryk, President of the “Our Choice” Foundation, Warsaw, Poland</p> <p><i>Working Session II will see participants discuss good practice as well as challenges and limitations in ensuring access to information, including dedicated web-sites, info-lines, migrant information centres, and language and civic orientation, with particular attention paid to less advantaged migrant groups. Discussion will focus in particular on co-operation between local authorities and other relevant partners, including schools and academia, civil society organizations and relevant public institutions, as well as steps to promote positive relations between migrants and receiving communities.</i></p>	<p><b>14:00-15:30</b></p> <p><b>90mins</b></p>
<p><b>Coffee Break</b></p>	
<p><b>Working Session III: Integration of immigrant children and youth at the local level: education-based measures and the role of youth organizations</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Prof. Nihad Bunar, University of Stockholm, Sweden</li> <li>- Ms. Hedwig Bvumburah, Director of Cross Culture International Foundation (CCIF), Paola, Malta</li> <li>- Mr. Omar Al-Rawi, member of Vienna City Council, Austria</li> <li>- Ms. Helga Maria Nagel, Board Member, the “Citoyen” Foundation, Frankfurt-am-Main, Germany</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair:</b> Ms. Maria Charmast, Coordinator of the “Zavarka” Club for Russian-speaking children and adults, Warsaw, Poland</p> <p><i>Working Session III will be an opportunity to discuss integration opportunities and challenges for migrant boys and girls and youth integration at the local level across the OSCE region. Presentations and discussion will focus on local authorities’ role in assisting and guiding schools’ integration of migrant children, including the prevention of segregation and exclusion in education. Participants will discuss how local authorities can encourage youth integration through participation, in co-operation with civil society and community organizations.</i></p>	<p><b>15:30-15:45</b></p> <p><b>15:45-17:15</b></p> <p><b>90mins</b></p>

<p><b>Closing Session: Presentation of roundtable conclusions and recommendations for ways forward</b></p> <p>Final discussion points and observations from participants.</p> <p><b>Final remarks</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Ms. Christine Hirst, Deputy Head of Democratization Department, ODIHR</li></ul> <p><i>The Closing Session will review the main conclusions and recommendations of the conference developed by participants during the previous Working Sessions.</i></p>	<p><b>17:15-18:00</b></p> <p><b>45mins</b></p>
<p><b>Close of the Conference</b></p>	<p><b>18:00</b></p>
<p><b>Reception at ODIHR Offices</b></p>	<p><b>18:00-20:00</b></p>

## **ANNEX 2: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

### **ARMENIA**

Ms. Irine Hakobyan, Head of Integration Unit, State Migration Service of the Republic of Armenia

Mr. Firdus Zakaryan, Chief of Staff, Ministry of Diaspora of the Republic of Armenia

### **AUSTRIA**

Mr. Omar Al-Rawi, Council Member, Vienna City Council

### **CZECH REPUBLIC**

Mr. Jan Janoušek, Migrant Integration Specialist, Prague City Hall

Ms. Magda Faltová, Director, Association for Integration and Migration, Prague

### **DENMARK**

Ms. Bitten Holmer Flansmose, Development and Integration Consultant, Municipality of Skanderborg

### **ESTONIA**

Mr. Kaarel-Mati Halla, Co-ordination Director, Tallinn City Government

### **THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA**

Mr. Dejan Ivkovski, Head of Unit for Migration, Integration of Refugees and Foreigners and Humanitarian Aid, Ministry for Labour and Social Policy

### **GEORGIA**

Mr. Temur Goginovi, Expert in Analytical Issues, Secretariat of the State Commission on Migration Issues, Public Service Development Agency, Ministry of Justice of Georgia

Ms. Natia Mestvirishvili, Researcher, Secretariat of the State Commission on Migration Issues, Public Service Development Agency, Ministry of Justice of Georgia

### **GERMANY**

Ms. Helga Maria Nagel, Board Member, the "Citoyen" Foundation, Frankfurt am Main

### **IRELAND**

Mr. Brian Killoran, Chief Executive Officer, Immigrant Council of Ireland

### **ITALY**

Mr. Giuseppe Nicolini, Project Co-ordinator, International Protection Service, Bologna

Ms. Silvia Zarrella, Researcher, NGO "Asilo in Europe"

### **KAZAKHSTAN**

Ms. Shakhnoza Khassanova, Vice-president, Legal Centre for Women's Initiatives "Sana Sezim", Shymkent

**LATVIA**

Ms. Irina Vasiljeva, Department of Education, Culture and Sports, Riga City Council

**MALTA**

Ms. Hedwig Bvumburah, Director, Cross Culture International Foundation (CCIF), Paola

**MOLDOVA**

Ms. Tatiana Ciumaş, Head of Integration and Accommodation Unit, Bureau for Migration and Asylum, Ministry of Interior of the Republic of Moldova

Mr. Ruslan Mazur, Senior Specialist, Integration and Accommodation Section, Asylum and Integration Directorate, Bureau of Migration and Asylum, Ministry of Interior of the Republic of Moldova

**POLAND**

Ms. Maria Charmast, Co-ordinator, "Zavarka" Club for Russian-speaking Adults and Children, Warsaw

Ms. Anna Fedas, Project Co-ordinator, European Solidarity Centre, Gdańsk

Ms. Myroslava Keryk, President of the "Our Choice" Foundation, Warsaw

**RUSSIAN FEDERATION**

Ms. Valentina Kazakova, Deputy Head of General Administration for Migration Issues, Ministry of Interior of the Russian Federation

**SERBIA**

Ms. Tatjana Barbulov, Trustee for Refugees and Migration, City of Kikinda

Ms. Jelena Marjanović, Expert for training on the development and implementation of EU projects, Commissariat for Refugees and Migration, Republic of Serbia

Ms. Vesna Ogarević, Expert for the implementation of activities stipulated in the Local Action Plans, Commissariat for Refugees and Migration, Republic of Serbia

**SLOVENIA**

Ms. Cvetka Kernel, Principle of Dormitory, Postojna

Ms. Dragana Kosić Petrović, Project Co-ordinator, Postojna Municipality

**SWEDEN**

Mr. Nihad Bunar, Professor, University of Stockholm

Mr. Maciej Kulak, Political Assistant, Embassy of Sweden in Poland

**SWITZERLAND**

Ms. Dominika Wieczorek, Senior National Programme Officer, Embassy of Switzerland in Poland

**UKRAINE**

Ms. Svitlana Boieva, Head of the International Department, Odessa City Council

Ms. Nadiia Diachuk, Senior Specialist on Social Integration, State Migration Service of Ukraine

**UNITED KINGDOM**

Mr. Charles Husband, Professor, University of Bradford / Sami University of Applied Sciences, Guovdageaidnu, Norway

Ms. Alicja Kaczmarek, Director, Polish Expatriates Association, Birmingham

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE**

Mr. Tomáš Boček, Special Representative on Migration and Refugees of the Secretary General, Council of Europe

Ms. Yoomi Renström, Rapporteur on Migration and Refugee Issues, Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe / Mayor of Ovanåker, Sweden

**IOM**

Ms. Anna Rostocka, Director, IOM Country Office in Warsaw

**MIGRATION POLICY GROUP**

Mr. Alexander Wolffhardt, Researcher, Migration Policy Group, Brussels

**OSCE**

**OSCE MISSION TO SERBIA**

Ms. Ružica Banda, Human Rights Programme Officer

**OSCE PROJECT CO-ORDINATOR IN UKRAINE**

Ms. Liliya Grudko, National Project Officer, CTHB and Migration, Human Security Programme

Ms. Olga Voitovych, Project Assistant, Human Security Programme

**OSCE OFFICE FOR DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS AND HUMAN RIGHTS**

Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, OSCE ODIHR First Deputy Director

Ms. Christine Hirst, OSCE ODIHR Democratization Department Deputy Head

Mr. Juris Gromovs, OSCE ODIHR Migration/Freedom of Movement Adviser

Ms. Joanna Fomina, Migration Expert

Ms. Rita Stafejeva, Administrative Assistant

### ANNEX 3: SELECTED OSCE COMMITMENTS IN THE AREA OF MIGRANT INTEGRATION

Since the 1975 Helsinki process OSCE participating States realized that increasing legal migration in the OSCE region has not only been beneficial both for host countries and migrants themselves, but has also given rise to a number of economic, social, human and other challenges<sup>2</sup>. Gradually the OSCE participating States acknowledged that some of those challenges should be addressed by means of special migrant integration policies.

Therefore, over more than 40 years,, the OSCE participating States have agreed to a number of commitments in the field of migrant integration. These commitments relating to the so-called human dimension of the OSCE are contained in an ever-growing set of documents adopted by CSCE/ OSCE Summits and other political forums.

The OSCE commitments form the basis of the work of the Organization and were developed jointly and adopted unanimously by all participating States. They establish clear standards for the participating States in their treatment of each other and of all individuals within their territories.

#### **Helsinki 1975** (Co-operation in the Field of Economics, of Science and Technology and of the Environment)

The participating States,

Considering that the movements of migrant workers in Europe have reached substantial proportions, and that they constitute an important economic, social and human factor for host countries as well as for countries of origin,

Recognizing that workers' migrations have also given rise to a number of economic, social, human and other problems in both the receiving countries and the countries of origin,

Taking due account of the activities of the competent international organizations, more particularly the International Labour Organisation, in this area, are of the opinion that the problems arising bilaterally from the migration of workers in Europe as well as between the participating States should be dealt with by the parties directly concerned, in order to resolve these problems in their mutual interest, in the light of the concern of each State involved to take due account of the requirements resulting from its socio-economic situation, having regard to the obligation of each State to comply with the bilateral and multilateral agreements to which it is party, and with the following aims in view:

- to encourage the efforts of the countries of origin directed towards increasing the possibilities of employment for their nationals in their own territories, in particular by developing economic co-operation appropriate for this purpose and suitable for the host countries and the countries of origin concerned;
- to ensure, through collaboration between the host country and the country of origin, the conditions under which the orderly movement of workers might take place, while at the same time protecting their personal and social welfare and, if appropriate, to organize the recruitment of migrant workers and the provision of elementary language and vocational training;
- to ensure equality of rights between migrant workers and nationals of the host countries with regard to conditions of employment and work and to social security, and to endeavour to ensure that migrant workers may enjoy satisfactory living conditions, especially housing conditions;
- to endeavour to ensure, as far as possible, that migrant workers may enjoy the same opportunities as nationals of the host countries of finding other suitable employment in the event of unemployment;
- to regard with favour the provision of vocational training to migrant workers and, as far as possible, free instruction in the language of the host country, in the framework of their employment;
- to confirm the right of migrant workers to receive, as far as possible, regular information in their own language, covering both their country of origin and the host country;
- to ensure that the children of migrant workers established in the host country have access to the education usually given there, under the same conditions as the children of that country and, furthermore, to permit them to receive supplementary education in their own language, national culture, history and geography;
- to bear in mind that migrant workers, particularly those who have acquired qualifications, can by returning to their countries after a certain period of time help to remedy any deficiency of skilled labour in their country of origin;
- to facilitate, as far as possible, the reuniting of migrant workers with their families.

#### **Madrid 2007** (Decisions: Decision No. 10/07 on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination: Promoting Mutual Respect and Understanding)

The Ministerial Council,

(...)

Recognizing that manifestations of intolerance and discrimination can undermine the efforts to protect the rights of individuals, including migrants, refugees and persons belonging to national minorities and stateless persons,

(...)

7. Calls on participating States to protect migrants legally residing in host countries and persons belonging to national minorities, stateless persons and refugees from racism, xenophobia, discrimination and violent acts of intolerance and

<sup>2</sup> Section "Economic and social aspects of migrant legal" of the Final Act of the Conference on Security and Co-operation in Europe (Helsinki 1975).



to elaborate or strengthen national strategies and programmes for the integration of regular migrants, which also requires active engagement of the latter;

(...)

#### **Vienna 1989** (Co-operation in the Field of Economics, of Science and Technology and of the Environment)

(40) The participating States emphasize the need for effective implementation of the provisions of the Final Act and the Madrid Concluding Document relating to migrant workers and their families in Europe. They invite host countries and countries of origin to make efforts to improve further the economic, social, cultural and other conditions of life for migrant workers and their families legally residing in the host countries. They recommend that host countries and countries of origin should promote their bilateral co-operation in relevant fields with a view to facilitating the reintegration of migrant workers and their families returning to their country of origin.

(41) The participating States will (...) consider favourably applications for family reunification as well as family contacts and visits involving migrant workers from other participating States legally residing in the host countries.

(42) The participating States will ensure that migrant workers from other participating States, and their families, can freely enjoy and maintain their national culture and have access to the culture of the host country.

(43) Aiming at ensuring effective equality of opportunity between the children of migrant workers and the children of their own nationals regarding access to all forms and levels of education, the participating States affirm their readiness to take measures needed for the better use and improvement of educational opportunities. Furthermore, they will encourage or facilitate, where reasonable demand exists, supplementary teaching in their mother tongue for the children of migrant workers.

(44) The participating States recognize that issues of migrant workers have their human dimension.

#### **Copenhagen 1990**

(22) The participating States reaffirm that the protection and promotion of the rights of migrant workers have their human dimension. In this context, they

(22.1) - agree that the protection and promotion of the rights of migrant workers are the concern of all participating States and that as such they should be addressed within the CSCE process;

(22.2) - reaffirm their commitment to implement fully in their domestic legislation the rights of migrant workers provided for in international agreements to which they are parties;

(22.3) - consider that, in future international instruments concerning the rights of migrant workers, they should take into account the fact that this issue is of importance for all of them;

(...)

#### **Paris 1990** (A New Era of Democracy, Peace and Unity)

We recognize that the issues of migrant workers and their families legally residing in host countries have economic, cultural and social aspects as well as their human dimension. We reaffirm that the protection and promotion of their rights, as well as the implementation of relevant international obligations, is our common concern.

#### **Moscow 1991**

(38) The participating States recognize the need to ensure that the rights of migrant workers and their families lawfully residing in the participating States are respected and underline their right to express freely their ethnic, cultural, religious and linguistic characteristics. The exercise of such rights may be subject to such restrictions as are prescribed by law and are consistent with international standards.

(38.1) They condemn all acts of discrimination on the ground of race, colour and ethnic origin, intolerance and xenophobia against migrant workers. They will, in conformity with domestic law and international obligations, take effective measures to promote tolerance, understanding, equality of opportunity and respect for the fundamental human rights of migrant workers and adopt, if they have not already done so, measures that would prohibit acts that constitute incitement to violence based on national, racial, ethnic or religious discrimination, hostility or hatred.

(38.2) They will adopt appropriate measures that would enable migrant workers to participate in the life of the society of the participating States.

(38.3) They note that issues which concern the human dimension of migrant workers residing on their territory could, as any other issue of the human dimension, be raised under the human dimension mechanism.

#### **Helsinki 1992** (Decisions: VI. The Human Dimension)

The participating States:

(...)

(36) Reiterate that human rights and fundamental freedoms are universal, that they are also enjoyed by migrant workers wherever they live and stress the importance of implementing all CSCE commitments on migrant workers and their families lawfully residing in the participating States;

(37) Will encourage the creation of conditions to foster greater harmony in relations between migrant workers and the rest of the society of the participating State in which they lawfully reside. To this end, they will seek to offer, *inter alia*, measures to facilitate the familiarization of migrant workers and their families with the languages and social life

of the respective participating State in which they lawfully reside so as to enable them to participate in the life of the society of the host country;

(38) Will, in accordance with their domestic policies, laws and international obligations seek, as appropriate, to create the conditions for promoting equality of opportunity in respect of working conditions, education, social security and health services, housing, access to trade unions as well as cultural rights for lawfully residing and working migrant workers.

**Budapest 1994** (Decisions: VIII. The Human Dimension)

31. They [*OSCE participating States*] will continue to promote the integration of migrant workers in the societies in which they are lawfully residing. They recognize that a successful process of integration also depends on its active pursuit by the migrants themselves and decided therefore to encourage them in this regard.

**Maastricht 2003** (Decisions: Decision No. 4/03 on Tolerance and Non-discrimination)

The Ministerial Council

(...)

11. Undertakes to combat discrimination against migrant workers. Further undertakes to facilitate the integration of migrant workers into the societies in which they are legally residing

(...)

**Sofia 2004** (Decisions: Annex to Decision No. 12/04 on Tolerance and Non-discrimination; Permanent Council Decision No. 621: Tolerance and the Fight against Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination)

The participating States commit to:

(...)

- Take steps, in conformity with their domestic law and international obligations, against discrimination, intolerance and xenophobia against migrants and migrant workers;
- Consider undertaking activities to raise public awareness of the enriching contribution of migrants and migrant workers to society;

(...)

**Ljubljana 2005** (Decisions: Decision No. 2/05 on Migration)

The Ministerial Council,

Reaffirming the commitments related to migration, and in particular regarding migrant workers, and other relevant commitments (...),

Recognizing the increasing importance of migration, as well as the challenges and opportunities that it presents to participating States,

Further recognizing that migration is becoming a more diverse and complex phenomenon, which needs to be addressed in a comprehensive manner and therefore requires a cross-dimensional approach at the national, regional and international levels,

Recognizing that all States should adopt effective national frameworks in order to manage migration,

Underlining that migration is inherently a transnational issue requiring co-operation between States,

Acknowledging that migration constitutes an important economic, social and human factor for host countries as well as for countries of origin,

Acknowledging also that successful integration policies that include respect for cultural and religious diversity and promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms are a factor in promoting stability and cohesion within our societies,

(...)

Considering that the OSCE, within its comprehensive approach to security, could contribute, *inter alia*, by:

- Working in synergy and developing a stronger partnership with international bodies having a specific focus on migration,
- Facilitating dialogue and co-operation between participating States, including countries of origin, transit and destination in the OSCE area, as well as the OSCE Partners for Cooperation and Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation,
- Assisting the participating States, upon their request, to develop effective migration policies and to implement their relevant OSCE commitments,
- Inviting participating States to consider becoming parties to relevant international Instruments.

**Athens 2009** (Decisions: Decision No. 5/09 on Migration Management)

The Ministerial Council,

Acknowledging the increasing importance of and the benefits stemming from effective migration management for the socio-economic development, social cohesion, security and stability in all countries including those of origin, transit and destination, and fully recognizing the human rights of migrants and their family members,

Underscoring the importance of mainstreaming migration policies into economic, social, environmental, development and security strategies and addressing migration management through co-operative, comprehensive and cross-dimensional approaches,

Underlining the need to facilitate legal migration and fight illegal migration,  
Bearing in mind the different approaches to migration issues by the OSCE participating States, and drawing on their experiences and best practices,

Stressing the need to deepen dialogue and co-operation at all levels within and between all States, as well as with all relevant stakeholders, including social partners, business community, civil society and academia, to effectively address the opportunities and challenges related to comprehensive migration management,

Confirming that co-operation, dialogue and exchange of good practices and information on migration management issues remain an important component of the OSCE's comprehensive concept of security, supported as appropriate and within the respective mandates, capacities and resources in all three dimensions,

1. Encourages the participating States to continue to work on migration management by:

- Paying particular attention to addressing the root causes of migration;
- Ensuring that their national migration practices comply with their respective international obligations and OSCE commitments;
- Further elaborating and enhancing implementation of comprehensive and effective national migration policies and action plans as appropriate;
- Improving the collection of comparable data on migration, in order to facilitate dialogue and exchange of best practices at the OSCE level;

(...)

- Respecting the human rights of migrants and increasing efforts to combat discrimination, intolerance and xenophobia towards migrants and their families;

(...)

5. Tasks the Permanent Council, its informal subsidiary bodies and the OSCE executive structures, in accordance with their respective mandates across all dimensions, within the Organization's comprehensive concept of security and within existing resources to *inter alia*:

- Provide a broad regional platform for dialogue on migration and security issues, both among OSCE participating States and between participating States and Partners for Cooperation, with the involvement of other relevant stakeholders in full conformity with the OSCE Rules of Procedure;
- Continue working on gender aspects of migration;
- Assist participating States, upon their request, to improve migration legislation and to elaborate and implement effective national policy frameworks, by providing advice and training, in co-operation with relevant international and regional organizations;

(...)

- Continue to assist the participating States, upon their request, to promote effective migration management, including exchange of best practices, and to facilitate legal migration and fight illegal migration, while paying particular attention to bilateral and multilateral co-operation in this field.

**Hamburg 2016** (Decisions: Decision No. 3/16 on OSCE's role in the governance of large movements of migrants and refugees)

The Ministerial Council,

Recognizing that the benefits and opportunities of safe, orderly and regular migration are substantial and often underestimated, whilst noting that irregular migration in large movements often presents complex challenges, and recognizing the substantial economic and social contribution that migrants and refugees can make for inclusive growth and sustainable development,

Recognizing the leading role of the United Nations, Commending efforts made since 2015 by the Serbian and German OSCE Chairmanships to address issues related to the governance of these movements more effectively in the OSCE, Acknowledging the many specific activities linked to migration and refugees already undertaken by OSCE executive structures, within existing mandates, as well as by participating States, based on existing OSCE commitments, relevant United Nations documents and national policies,

Building on in-depth discussions conducted at the OSCE, especially during the hearings of the Informal Working Group Focusing on the Issue of Migration and Refugee Flows in spring 2016 and during a special meeting of the OSCE Permanent Council held on 20 July 2016,

1. Acknowledges the work of the Informal Working Group Focusing on the Issue of Migration and Refugee Flows and the output discussed at the special meeting of the OSCE Permanent Council of 20 July 2016;
2. Encourages the OSCE executive structures, within existing mandates and available resources, to continue their work on the issue of migration, including by reinforcing activities leading to the exchange of best practices and enhancing dialogue and co-operation with Partners for Co-operation, in a manner that complements the activities undertaken by other relevant international organizations and agencies;
3. Encourages participating States also to use the OSCE platform, including appropriate OSCE working bodies, to continue addressing migration-related issues where the OSCE has developed its expertise, and improve dialogue on migration-related matters with regard to developing possible effective measures and common approaches to address them.

## ABOUT THE OSCE/ODIHR

The Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (OSCE/ODIHR) is the OSCE's principal institution to assist participating States "to ensure full respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, to abide by the rule of law, to promote principles of democracy and (...) to build, strengthen and protect democratic institutions, as well as promote tolerance throughout society" (1992 Helsinki Summit Document). This is referred to as the OSCE human dimension.

The OSCE/ODIHR, based in Warsaw (Poland) was created as the Office for Free Elections at the 1990 Paris Summit and started operating in May 1991. One year later, the name of the Office was changed to reflect an expanded mandate to include human rights and democratization. Today it employs over 130 staff.

The OSCE/ODIHR is the lead agency in Europe in the field of **election observation**. Every year, it co-ordinates and organizes the deployment of thousands of observers to assess whether elections in the OSCE region are conducted in line with OSCE Commitments, other international obligations and standards for democratic elections and with national legislation. Its unique methodology provides an in-depth insight into the electoral process in its entirety. Through assistance projects, the OSCE/ODIHR helps participating States to improve their electoral framework.

The Office's **democratization** activities include: rule of law, legislative support, democratic governance, migration and freedom of movement, and gender equality. The OSCE/ODIHR implements a number of targeted assistance programs annually, seeking to develop democratic structures.

The OSCE/ODIHR also assists participating States' in fulfilling their obligations to promote and protect **human rights** and fundamental freedoms consistent with OSCE human dimension commitments. This is achieved by working with a variety of partners to foster collaboration, build capacity and provide expertise in thematic areas including human rights in the fight against terrorism, enhancing the human rights protection of trafficked persons, human rights education and training, human rights monitoring and reporting, and women's human rights and security.

Within the field of **tolerance** and **non-discrimination**, the OSCE/ODIHR provides support to the participating States in strengthening their response to hate crimes and incidents of racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and other forms of intolerance. The OSCE/ODIHR's activities related to tolerance and non-discrimination are focused on the following areas: legislation; law enforcement training; monitoring, reporting on, and following up on responses to hate-motivated crimes and incidents; as well as educational activities to promote tolerance, respect, and mutual understanding.

The OSCE/ODIHR provides advice to participating States on their policies on **Roma and Sinti**. It promotes capacity-building and networking among Roma and Sinti communities, and encourages the participation of Roma and Sinti representatives in policy-making bodies.

All ODIHR activities are carried out in close co-ordination and co-operation with OSCE participating States, OSCE institutions and field operations, as well as with other international organizations.

More information is available on the ODIHR website ([www.osce.org/odihhr](http://www.osce.org/odihhr)).